

Template: Criteria for a Search

Examples of criteria, descriptions, etc.—Note that these are abridged, and that some may carry their own biases

Core Criteria (max. 5)	Description	Evidence	Rank/ Weight
Excellent researcher	Science of outstanding quality Strong, respectful protocols for working with research populations Track record of effective knowledge translation Substantial body of literature as a senior author Substantial success in attracting peer-reviewed research funding	Research awards, recognitions, etc. Funding history Research protocols Committee's assessment of publications/research	40%
Technical skills in xyz	Able to use XYZ to produce findings; able to explain XYZ to colleagues/ collaborators/students; able to manage a project that uses XYZ	Has managed a project/ conducted research/published/etc. using xyz	20%
Teaching/ Manage a team	Proven excellence in teaching and mentoring of diverse students	Syllabi; references	20%
Respectful and collegial	Work experiences detail communication, dealing well with conflict, bridging differences and treating coworkers, supervisors & students well	Responses to questions; references	20%

Asset Criteria (max. 3)	Description	Evidence	Rank/ Weight
Ability to teach in XYZ area	Able to develop new courses/ pick up existing courses	Course and research areas; interest	1
Administrative experience	Able to chair [type of committees]/ assume Chair role in future/ other	Expressed interest; experience	2

Keep in Mind ... good criteria:

- Reflect the core responsibilities—key things someone needs to do well to succeed in this role
- Identify what is needed within an evolving unit—look to the future as you identify these
- Focus on what someone needs to do, not their qualifications to do it. This means integrating transferable skills and equivalencies
- Are unbiased and open to a diversity of persons—have others review criteria for unintended biases
- Are fleshed out: have a description, identify the evidence someone will need to show that they fulfill the criterion, are given a relative weight
- Are developed by the committee as a whole and understood by each member of the committee
- Not too broad or too narrow: Describe the main elements sought

How to use the criteria:

- They are the basis for every decision the committee makes.
- Design interview, questions and assessment tools to assess criteria in a robust manner. Ensure you have some way to gather evidence for each criterion.
- At every stage, record information and scoring for candidates relative to the criteria (see next template).
- Ask everyone who provides feedback on the candidates to review these and provide feedback in relation to the criteria.

Template: Tracking Criteria Across a Search

This tool can help committees avoid biased decisions. It encourages them to pay attention to all the evidence about each candidate, ensuring more holistic, accurate evaluations.

Steps:

- Devise a simple scale and define each level carefully. E.g., *strong, adequate, weak* or *not noted*; Present or absent; or your own scale.
- For each cell, indicate how much that criterion is present in that set of materials.
- When discussing candidates and making decisions, use the scoring as a guide but not as the final answer. Instead, refer back to the evidence in the application to verify that it matches the scoring, and compare across candidates.
- Look at every column in determining how well a candidate meets each criterion, not just the most recent or interesting.

Benefits and ways this reduces bias:

- Gets committee to review every source of information, not just select ones
- Keeps focus on criteria rather than the candidates’ personality or “fit”
- By looking back at evidence from all application materials, avoids the “recency effect” whereby newer information is given more weight
- Balances out the impact of strong personalities during the interview

Candidate name/ identifying number:

	COVER LETTER	CV/ RESUME	OTHER MATERIALS	INTERVIEW	PRESENTATION	REFERENCES	OTHER	SUMMARY: STRENGTH OF CRITERION
Core Criteria								
1.								
2.								
3.								
Asset Criteria								
1.								
2.								